

Minutes of the August 26, 2014 meeting.

Beth Jacob made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to defer this matter for 30-days.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3331 Esplanade Ave: Douglas Mayo, applicant; Kenneth Tassin, owner; Add a second floor covered porch to a portion of the rear of the building facing Fortin St.

The ARC agreed that the detailing of the new porch should take cues from the historic wood architecture of the rest of the building and preferred the proposed Scheme 1. However, the exposed metal pipe columns were not appropriate. They would like to see the existing metal stair reconfigured in wood to match the new porch construction. The shape of the proposed porch creates an awkward geometry at the roof. They recommended re-working the plan so that it is either evenly segmented or radial like the existing balcony at the front of the building. This would allow a simpler roof form to match. The roof slope should be decreased to allow a higher eave height at the addition. The proposed columns-on-piers lends itself to porch construction. As there is no porch proposed, the bases of these columns should be re-worked. Paired columns should be explored.

Wayne Troyer made a motion, seconded by John Klingman, to defer a recommendation for approval.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2116-2118 Burgundy St: Eric Epstein, applicant; W Epstein Revocable Trust Eric, owner; Construct camelback addition.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer, to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC of Option 1 with a setback of the walls to allow for windows, and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3137-3139 Constance St: Kim Hosch, applicant; Ruppert N Kohlmaier, Jr, owner; Construct four-story, approximately 32,800 sf, multi-family development (one level of off street parking at grade and three levels of residential above) on existing vacant lot.

The ARC agreed the lower three-story height of the building is appropriate, but the scale of the floors should emulate that of the surrounding context. Specifically, the height of the ground floor appears low without reading as a base. The ARC suggested investigating the required flood grade further; it may be possible to obtain an exception and lower the height of the first floor to 18" because the property is located in a historic area. The ARC agreed the green walls and balconies of Scheme A are more successful at engaging the surrounding neighborhood and addressing the transition from commercial to residential, and that Scheme B too closely emulates the nearby school building, which serves a public function. However, the ARC also noted that the exterior architecture should reflect the interior function and not be a dressing.

The ARC agreed the blank walls, garage doors, and fenced green spaces at the ground floor of the building do not adequately engage the street and pedestrian and are not appropriate to the Irish Channel local historic district. The ARC recommended reconfiguring the plan to have direct ground floor access, particularly at the units at the corners of Constance Street. The ARC suggested this may be successfully accomplished by having one-story units at the ground floor and two-story units above, which would also reduce the amount of space dedicated to circulation; reducing the number of units, thereby reducing the number of required parking spaces; and/or by relocating the storage from the ground floor to an upper floor. The ARC recommended studying the proposal in section. The ARC agreed that while it is unfortunate that the building covers nearly the entirety of the site, the green space provided at the rear of the building on 9th Street reads as residual and may be reduced or eliminated to improve the design elsewhere at the ground floor. Furthermore, the 2'-0" deep pockets of landscaping along the edges of the building also read as residual and should be studied further to achieve the expression of green space that is intended.

Wayne Troyer made a motion, seconded by John Klingman, to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

832 Bartholomew St: Greg Fuselier, applicant/owner; Conceptual review of thirteen, two-story, 1900 sq ft single family residential buildings.

The ARC agreed that overall site planning proposed was a good approach, although they did agree that an entire block of repetitive row houses was unusual for this neighborhood. They recommended that you should conduct some research, such as with Sanborn Maps, to determine historic residential development of this part of the District.

Although the ARC found the detailing of the proposed buildings to be conceptually appropriate, they had the following recommendations:

- There should be three distinct designs proposed - one for the four buildings on Bartholomew Street, and two for the Burgundy Street buildings. These should be

grouped appropriately. Because the Bartholomew Street lots are wider, these buildings should have three bays.

- Simplify the front portico. As shown it is too Georgian for New Orleans residential architecture. There should be single columns instead of double. The pediment should be smaller.
- Explore extending covered porches across front elevations of the buildings along Bartholomew and providing stoops at front elevations of others. This will allow for better communication with the street.
- Increase the reveal of the siding on front elevations.

Wayne Troyer made a motion, seconded by Elliott Perkins, to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1500 St. Charles Ave: John Guarnieri, applicant; DJE, LLC, owner: New construction of a 40,000 sf hotel, as Phase I of development, to include a renovation at 1530 St. Charles

Although the ARC agreed that the concept of the gallery proposed was successful and interestingly complex, the fenestration of the building itself needs further study. The building appears oddly tall in relation to the gallery. The galleries should be more open without the opaque dividers shown. The first floor ceiling height is very tall while that of the other floors is short. The treatment of the cut-through at the driveway is awkward. There should be a more intentional treatment of this area. There is a great opportunity to bring visual interest to this functional element of the program. There should be a parapet condition at the top of the building as opposed to the cornice shown. The fencing should be more interesting than what was shown.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to recommend conceptual approval of the massing but requiring review the revisions of the architectural detailing.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

641 St Ferdinand St: Fernandez & Johnson Architect, applicant; Tatum H Neill, owner; Construct new, one-story, 2600 sq ft, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

The ARC agreed the overall proposal is appropriate, but several of the details need further study:

- The detailing of the windows should be considered at this stage of design development, as they this will have a significant impact on the architecture of the building. The ARC recommended recessing the windows so that the depth and shadow reinforce the form of the window. The fenestration on the St. Ferdinand Street facade should have greater operability. The material between the clerestory windows should be considered and defined.
- The proposed plastic corrugated material is excessively derivative and the ARC expressed concern regarding its durability in the local climate. The ARC recommended using true corrugated metal.
- The brick fence needs further study. The material and articulation should relate more directly to the specific architecture of the proposed building rather than replicate a typical brick wall condition.
- The ARC could not reach consensus on the roof form as it is seen on the St. Ferdinand Street facade. Some members argued the single sloping shed roof does not relate to the residential context and is appropriate to service wings and accessory buildings, not the the front facade of a main house. These members suggested a parapeted wall on the St. Ferdinand Street facade, turning the sloped roof and creating a valley if there is a desire to retain the clerestory windows on this elevation. Other members argued the roof as shown is appropriate to the style of the building. The ARC requested a study of the roof form in three dimensions for its next review.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal on the condition the proposal return for additional review of the details after the ARC recommendations are incorporated.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3700 Orleans Ave: Jack Sawyer, applicant; ACV VII LLC, owner; Permit for modifications/upgrades to the American Can building retail facade at ground level facing Orleans Ave.

The ARC agreed that, although the proposal is much improved, there is still issue with the proposed large scale signage. As this is a designated landmark and retail is a secondary function, the new signage should be subordinate to that of main building. This new signage should be responsive to the existing lettering on the building in font, weight and scale.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer, to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3101 St Thomas St: Joseph Hermo, applicant; Cooper Stevedoring Co Inc, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Elliott Perkins, to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The dormers should be narrower. The ARC suggested 3'-0" to 3'-6".
- The header height at the first floor should be raised to 8'-6", which will allow for an appropriately sized transom above the front door and 5'-6" tall windows at the side elevations.
- The lights of the small window on the left side elevation at the bathroom should orient vertically. This may require reducing the number of lights or changing the type of window.
- The overhangs at the front and rear are not appropriate and this detail needs further study. The overhangs at the sides should be eliminated.
- The front porch columns should be rectangular. The ARC suggested 10"x6".
- A 6'-0" deep porch is preferred if it is possible to adjust the siting of the house.
- The windows on the left side elevation need to move further away from the edges of the roof.
- Although it is customary to orient the front of the house to the narrower side of the lot, it is acceptable to rotate the building to face toward 8th Street, should this be allowed by the Department of Safety & Permits.

5701 Dauphine St: C Kent & Associates, applicant; Stephanie P Gibson, owner; New construction of a 1600 s.f single family residential building

The ARC agreed that the proposal has responded well to previous recommendations and is much improved. However, they made the following recommendations:

- The roof slope should be increased to 7:12.
- There should be one window type that is used throughout the building which should be double hung with traditional styling and installation.
- The porch should be eliminated at the right side of the front elevation. A gable should be added over the porch at the left side of the front elevation, similar to that of the building adjacent to the right.

Elliott Perkins made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob, to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1758-1760 N Rampart St, 1034-1040 St Anthony St: Raymond Bergeron, applicant; New Orleans Triumph Baptist Church, owner; General renovation of existing building, including modification of window and door openings and dormer addition.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer, to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendation that the roof at the sides of the dormer be extended 8"-10" and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1701-1705 Burgundy St, 1707 Burgundy St: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; Elisa Speranza, owner; Construct passage between buildings; install skylight.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2113-2115 Chartres St: Donald Maginnis Architect, applicant; Bcno 5 LLC, owner; Install decorative metal guardrail and handrails at front porch.

The ARC agreed that while a metal handrail could be approved, the proposed handrail inappropriately competes with the design of this Eastlake style building. Elliott Perkins made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer, to recommend denial of the proposal as presented, and suggested investigating using a railing design that is in keeping with the style of this building but is made of metal or another weather resistant material, or install a plain, vertical picket metal handrail. The ARC noted that appropriate Eastlake railings are readily available in polyurethane, resin, and cellular PVC.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1221 Orange St: Michael Carbine, applicant/owner; Construct a two-story accessory structure with two-car garage on 1st floor (no plumbing) and art studio on 2nd floor.

Although the ARC agreed that the allusion to carriage house architecture is appropriate for this building type and function, they made the following recommendations:

- The proposed accessory building should be moved farther from the main building, perhaps to the property line, although they did agree that you should be careful not to damage the root system of the large tree. The building should not compete spatially with the existing building.

- The height and massing of the roof should be diminished so as to remain subordinate to the main building.
- The "language" of the accessory building should respond to that of the main building.
- The lites of the French doors shown are too large.
- Three dimensional modeling of the buildings and site would be helpful for further study and review.
- The ARC advises you to present this to BZA before developing detailed construction documents.

Elliott Perkins made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob, to defer action on this matter.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3230 Camp St (3212 Camp St): Daniel Zangara, applicant; Bch Nola 3230 Camp LLC, owner; Construction of a two-story, single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Elliott Perkins, to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- The band at the sides should terminate on the sides of the building at the corners in the traditional manner.
- A large, wood drop-lap siding should be installed at the front facade.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3149 St Thomas St: Richard E Boe, applicant; Development South LLC, Richard E Boe, owner; Construct a one-story, two-family residence and detached accessory building on existing vacant lot.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Elliott Perkins, to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendation:

- A window be added to the left elevation at the family room near the front corner.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2373-2375 Laurel St: Kim Finney, applicant; Hill Riddle, Jr, owner; General renovation, including 2nd floor addition.

Wayne Troyer made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- Although real windows are preferred at the addition, the installation of shutters to imply windows is appropriate. The proposal for a blank wall at the addition is not appropriate.
- The roof form should not change at the addition. Instead the existing roof slope from the main house should extend over the addition.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

921 Race St: Kim Finney, applicant; Sawdust Developments LLC, owner; Conversion of 7 unit apartment building to three units and one garage; addition of 2nd floor.

The ARC agreed that the proposal greatly improves the existing building. The contemporary vocabulary is appropriate, as are the glass handrails, although they will need to properly detailed. However, they did make the following recommendations:

- The forward facing garage door is problematic as shown. The flatness of the front elevation should be more articulated, perhaps with a heavier gallery with an external stair. The garage doors could then be on a recessed plane.
- There should be more openness of the front facing elevation which will provide a stronger connection with the street.
- Install a 4'-0" high fence at the front property line.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob to defer approval of the proposal.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1442 St Claude Ave (Henriette Delille): Alex Modinger, applicant; Providence Community Housing, owner; New construction of a two family residential building.

The ARC agreed that the proposal is successful with the following recommendations:

- Simplify the arrangement of the side porch as per the enclosed sketch.
- Add a transom to the side door so that there is a consistent header height throughout.
- Simplify handrails to HDLC approved wood handrails.
- Correct the drawings to show a 3'-0" deep rear balcony.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1209 N Villere St: Kim Finney, applicant; Providence Community Housing, owner; Repair of existing exterior and interior finishes of an existing house.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob, to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1519 Camp Pl: Natan Diacon-Furtado, applicant; Wayne J Troyer, owner; Reworking of garage for a new kitchen and a reworking of the roof line and new exterior fenestration.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob, to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please submit one set of final detailed drawings reflecting the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2509 Carondelet St (2513 Carondelet St): J C Carroll, applicant; The Alex Of Metairie LLC, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

- An entry should be located at the front of the building. The ARC suggested relocating the building further from the front property line to allow for the stairs to be located in front of the door and possibly for a fence to be added.
- A window should be added to the left (3rd Street) side elevation at the stairs to break up the blank wall.
- The columns should be rectangular. The ARC suggested 8"x6".

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2505 Carondelet St (2503-2511 Carondelet St): J C Carroll, applicant; The Alex Of Metairie LLC, owner; Partial demolition and construction of rear addition.

The ARC agreed the attachment of the mass of the addition to the remaining existing building is awkward and the forms are inappropriately competing. Furthermore, while the scale of the floors is appropriate, the shed dormers are too large. The ARC recommended reconsidering the rear addition as a three-story building that appears to be tenuously connected to the remaining existing building. The ARC suggested the service component could be relocated to the connection, the connecting piece could be recessed, and a contemporary articulation of the addition could be successful.

The ARC agreed the restoration of the front building needs to be correctly rendered to be adequately reviewed. The ARC agreed the awning at the front facade needs further study, as the existing awning is clunky, but the architecture and Sandborn maps indicate there was a single awning across the entire facade. The ARC recommended adding panels below the windows at the ground floor of the front facade to evoke the doors the windows are replacing.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer, to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2401-2403 St Claude Ave: Lacey Wotring, applicant; Selina K Funches, owner; General renovation and restoration of existing building, including construction of 700 sf, one story addition.

Crystal Mitchell made a motion, seconded by Elliott Perkins, to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendation that clerestory windows be added.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

2414 Laurel St: Joel Ross, applicant; Craig M Marcello, owner; General renovation and restoration of existing building.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

3132 Laurel St, 835-845 9Th St: Champion Homes Of Louisiana, LLC, applicant/owner; Retention of changes to roof form, modifications to door and window openings, and extension of balcony without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Elliott Perkins made a motion, seconded by Wayne Troyer to deny the proposed changes to the roof and grant approval to the remaining items with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1207 Gallier St: Construction of a camelback addition on an existing single shotgun residential building.

The ARC recommends reducing the width of the second floor camelback to the width of the existing shotgun building. The width of the first floor is approvable with a simplified roof. If you need to make up programmable area you could extend the camelback one bay forward over the existing building.

Wayne Troyer made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

447-449 Elmira Ave: George B Jr Christen, applicant/owner; Demolish existing shed at rear of property and construct new shed

Elliott Perkins made a motion, seconded by Beth Jacob, to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

1818 Burgundy St.: Jonathan Irpino applicant/owner; Demolition of existing commercial building and construction of three, two-story residential buildings.

The ARC agreed the splaying of the building forms allows for an appropriate massing at the street edge, but an inappropriate massing at the rear of the wedge shape that is created between the buildings. While the reduction from four units to three allows for the mass to more comfortably inhabit the site, it is not clear that it allows enough space at the rear so as not to create an impractical, uninhabitable condition between the buildings. The ARC commented that it is open to contemporary forms, and the roof form should reflect the surrounding context but also relate to the architecture of the building.

John Klingman made a motion, seconded by Crystal Mitchell, to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations and further development of the proposal.

For: Jacob, Mitchell, Klingman, Troyer, Perkins

Against:

Result: Passed

